

# Enhancing the Transferability of Adversarial Attacks with Stealth Preservation

## Supplementary Material

### 1. Model Ensemble Algorithm

The *MMIA* algorithm for an ensemble of models is summarized in Algorithm 1.

**Algorithm 1** MMIA Algorithm for an ensemble of models

**Input:**  $K$  Classifiers with loss function  $J_0, J_1, \dots, J_{k-1}$ , real example  $x$ , ground-truth label  $y$ , outer iterations  $t$ , inner iterations  $n$ , transformation probability  $p$ , perturbation size  $\beta$ , max perturbation  $\varepsilon$ , perturbation step size  $\alpha$ , decay factor  $\mu$ ;

**Output:** Adversarial example  $x^*$ ;

- 1: Init transformations function  $T(\cdot)$ ;
- 2:  $Grad_0 = 0$ ;  $x^* = x$ ;
- 3: **for**  $i = 0$  to  $t - 1$  **do**
- 4:   **for**  $t = 0$  to  $k - 1$  **do**
- 5:     **for**  $j = 0$  to  $n - 1$  **do**
- 6:        $x_{itj}^* = T(x_{it}^*)$  with the probability  $p$
- 7:       Get gradient  $G_j$  of  $x_{itj}^*$  by Eq ??.
- 8:     **end for**
- 9:     Obtain spatial momentum gradient  $g_{it}^s$  by
 
$$g_{it}^s = \frac{1}{n} \sum G_j$$
- 10:      $Mask_{it} = SearchMask(g_{it}^s, \beta)$ ;
- 11:     **end for**
- 12:     Get  $sumGrad_i$  by Eq ??.
- 13:     Update  $Grad_{i+1}$  by
 
$$Grad_{i+1} = \mu Grad_i + \frac{sumGrad_i}{\|sumGrad_i\|_1}$$
- 14:     Update  $x_{i+1}^*$  by
 
$$x_{i+1}^* = x_i^* + \alpha \cdot sign(Grad_{i+1})$$
- 15:     Clip  $x_{i+1}^*$  according to  $\varepsilon$ ;
- 16:     **end for**
- 17: **return**  $x^* = x_t^*$

Table 2.1. The attack success and stealth score ( $AS^3$ ) (%) of non-targeted adversarial attacks against 6 models on CIFAR-10 dataset. \* represent the white-box attacks.

	Attack	Inception v3	ResNet50	VGG16	MobileNet	DenseNet	GoogleNet
Inception v3	FGSM	58.72*	43.84	57.74	64.01	52.39	59.08
	MI-FGSM	76.55*	55.03	66.72	67.56	57.79	67.56
	SMI-FGSM	75.66*	54.58	68.12	66.41	55.78	65.42
	MMIA	<b>78.73*</b>	<b>65.01</b>	<b>68.13</b>	<b>69.15</b>	<b>64.30</b>	<b>70.20</b>
ResNet50	FGSM	58.09	51.37*	54.74	62.49	50.13	56.24
	MI-FGSM	75.62	85.63*	70.33	71.57	77.23	70.10
	SMI-FGSM	76.05	86.10*	72.36	73.31	78.39	69.67
	MMIA	<b>80.98</b>	<b>87.10*</b>	<b>80.60</b>	<b>77.52</b>	<b>83.72</b>	<b>75.94</b>
VGG16	FGSM	57.48	42.03	48.18*	61.05	46.47	53.17
	MI-FGSM	69.93	57.44	<b>81.63*</b>	67.43	58.10	<b>63.25</b>
	SMI-FGSM	62.72	53.15	76.46*	60.18	55.20	57.56
	MMIA	<b>70.90</b>	<b>68.41</b>	80.58*	<b>67.83</b>	<b>68.53</b>	62.94
MobileNet	FGSM	70.18	60.39	66.77	71.96*	62.70	67.55
	MI-FGSM	80.34	63.02	74.95	86.13*	64.80	73.87
	SMI-FGSM	82.60	65.95	75.05	87.81*	67.92	75.14
	MMIA	<b>84.79</b>	<b>76.21</b>	<b>80.09</b>	<b>87.92*</b>	<b>75.94</b>	<b>77.91</b>
DenseNet	FGSM	58.38	48.18	52.33	63.92	50.26*	55.55
	MI-FGSM	76.36	76.08	73.22	70.79	85.20*	68.93
	SMI-FGSM	72.75	76.49	71.48	72.60	83.80*	67.67
	MMIA	<b>79.37</b>	<b>82.30</b>	<b>77.15</b>	<b>75.21</b>	<b>87.09*</b>	<b>74.28</b>
GoogleNet	FGSM	67.53	51.54	64.02	67.87	56.86	68.46*
	MI-FGSM	75.31	53.55	63.47	73.46	55.56	86.41*
	SMI-FGSM	78.50	53.45	67.88	73.28	56.54	<b>88.28*</b>
	MMIA	<b>81.41</b>	<b>65.73</b>	<b>71.80</b>	<b>77.08</b>	<b>67.73</b>	88.21*

### 2. Complete Results

Table 2.1 and Table 2.2 show the complete results on the CIFAR-10 dataset and ImageNet dataset, respectively

Table 2.2. The attack success and stealth score ( $AS^3$ ) (%) of non-targeted adversarial attacks against 10 models on ImageNet dataset. \* represent the white-box attacks.

	Attack	Inception v3	ResNet50	VGG16	MobileNet	DenseNet	GoogleNet	ResNet50 <sub>adv</sub>	MobileNet <sub>adv</sub>	ShuffleNet <sub>adv</sub>	RegNetX <sub>adv</sub>
Inception v3	FGSM	45.95*	21.51	21.55	32.89	24.62	28.69	<b>6.81</b>	21.01	<b>19.52</b>	<b>6.24</b>
	MI-FGSM	63.23*	24.23	23.29	33.57	24.89	27.52	4.29	18.54	15.42	4.39
	SMI-FGSM	49.82*	19.00	16.37	25.80	18.47	21.35	4.30	21.07	9.73	3.65
	MMIA	<b>71.54*</b>	<b>38.41</b>	<b>31.59</b>	<b>41.73</b>	<b>39.73</b>	<b>40.13</b>	5.08	<b>24.38</b>	11.86	4.72
ResNet50	FGSM	24.14	37.38*	24.52	31.66	27.48	26.77	<b>6.37</b>	21.13	<b>18.54</b>	<b>6.19</b>
	MI-FGSM	34.5	63.60*	38.55	41.93	44.53	35.68	5.04	20.81	14.27	5.19
	SMI-FGSM	22.94	49.95*	21.02	29.19	28.10	23.06	4.31	24.96	11.25	4.23
	MMIA	<b>57.76</b>	<b>71.67*</b>	<b>56.46</b>	<b>58.31</b>	<b>65.42</b>	<b>55.12</b>	5.43	<b>30.78</b>	10.79	5.27
VGG16	FGSM	22.69	24.37	44.92*	32.31	26.61	27.63	<b>6.69</b>	20.35	<b>19.35</b>	<b>6.32</b>
	MI-FGSM	33.92	37.77	64.20*	45.30	42.68	37.68	5.10	20.73	14.63	4.63
	SMI-FGSM	19.37	21.58	52.67	27.90	24.14	22.68	4.49	23.52	11.72	4.62
	MMIA	<b>49.08</b>	<b>54.22</b>	<b>71.20</b>	<b>57.84</b>	<b>58.82</b>	<b>50.16</b>	5.30	<b>28.35</b>	12.81	4.92
MobileNet	FGSM	24.81	25.11	28.15	52.87*	27.74	29.85	<b>6.86</b>	23.36	<b>19.62</b>	<b>6.92</b>
	MI-FGSM	33.53	34.72	39.00	62.96*	37.68	34.09	4.99	26.83	17.17	5.54
	SMI-FGSM	21.98	20.60	23.46	58.52*	25.51	25.12	5.01	28.65	12.52	4.66
	MMIA	<b>60.56</b>	<b>58.88</b>	<b>58.30</b>	<b>70.90*</b>	<b>61.63</b>	<b>58.22</b>	5.14	<b>43.30</b>	14.30	6.47
DenseNet	FGSM	22.73	23.23	23.60	32.76	38.72*	25.72	<b>6.51</b>	21.18	<b>19.33</b>	<b>5.68</b>
	MI-FGSM	33.44	38.15	34.36	40.55	63.80*	34.75	4.94	21.84	15.04	4.49
	SMI-FGSM	21.25	23.78	20.36	30.42	52.97*	23.03	3.74	25.75	11.35	4.04
	MMIA	<b>50.98</b>	<b>56.87</b>	<b>51.17</b>	<b>55.66</b>	<b>71.85*</b>	<b>50.12</b>	5.19	<b>29.66</b>	13.06	5.40
GoogleNet	FGSM	26.23	22.69	24.94	35.35	24.84	53.21*	<b>6.73</b>	23.16	<b>19.28</b>	<b>6.26</b>
	MI-FGSM	31.47	26.72	29.98	37.99	30.11	63.67*	5.15	21.26	15.74	4.69
	SMI-FGSM	21.70	17.78	17.69	29.16	19.78	56.44*	4.22	22.73	13.34	4.57
	MMIA	<b>55.47</b>	<b>47.76</b>	<b>44.62</b>	<b>54.57</b>	<b>51.82</b>	<b>71.59*</b>	5.05	<b>31.11</b>	13.22	5.50
ResNet50 <sub>adv</sub>	FGSM	45.26	43.28	40.72	46.94	43.03	48.23	49.27*	50.01	36.03	36.37
	MI-FGSM	59.99	<b>55.22</b>	<b>50.67</b>	<b>59.96</b>	<b>55.64</b>	60.26	67.61*	65.65	46.21	50.70
	SMI-FGSM	26.47	21.51	21.72	32.86	22.40	28.78	44.91*	45.58	35.32	27.79
	MMIA	<b>60.95</b>	52.34	48.42	57.71	52.88	<b>62.58</b>	<b>71.12*</b>	<b>68.46</b>	<b>52.96</b>	<b>56.08</b>
MobileNet <sub>adv</sub>	FGSM	23.92	19.49	22.65	32.01	22.73	28.73	7.86	51.52*	15.19	6.78
	MI-FGSM	28.30	19.30	20.98	35.05	22.59	32.37	<b>21.50</b>	69.09*	<b>39.56</b>	<b>18.17</b>
	SMI-FGSM	19.00	16.09	17.39	29.97	18.81	21.93	5.32	59.93*	12.63	5.30
	MMIA	<b>45.86</b>	<b>33.39</b>	<b>34.93</b>	<b>51.19</b>	<b>38.84</b>	<b>45.05</b>	10.95	<b>70.95*</b>	17.85	10.44
ShuffleNet <sub>adv</sub>	FGSM	25.38	23.09	23.16	35.99	24.71	33.06	21.65	40.89	53.88*	20.02
	MI-FGSM	<b>33.80</b>	27.11	27.55	<b>42.41</b>	<b>30.46</b>	37.96	28.27	52.53	70.94*	25.69
	SMI-FGSM	21.25	16.96	18.84	30.80	20.13	25.56	21.31	38.89	54.80*	18.92
	MMIA	30.94	<b>27.55</b>	<b>28.20</b>	41.09	29.52	<b>39.96</b>	<b>35.47</b>	<b>54.71</b>	<b>78.75*</b>	<b>31.25</b>
RegNetX <sub>adv</sub>	FGSM	46.39	43.65	40.61	46.64	44.30	46.77	35.66	50.65	32.77	51.26*
	MI-FGSM	62.93	57.97	<b>53.35</b>	61.36	<b>59.10</b>	63.38	50.36	63.32	44.66	70.22*
	SMI-FGSM	29.12	24.15	23.84	33.79	25.61	31.25	30.07	42.72	33.57	42.07*
	MMIA	<b>66.00</b>	<b>58.97</b>	53.04	<b>61.66</b>	57.53	<b>67.85</b>	<b>56.26</b>	<b>69.28</b>	<b>50.63</b>	<b>74.27*</b>