Revisit PCA-based technique for Out-of-distribution Detection

Liu^{1,3*} Wei-Shi Zheng^{1,3} Ruixuan Wang^{1,2,3†} Zhouwu Liu^{1,3*} Xiaoyuan Guan^{1,3*} Yuren Zhou^{1†}

¹School of Computer Science and Engineering, Sun Yat-sen University, Guangzhou, China ²Peng Cheng Laboratory, Shenzhen, China

³Key Laboratory of Machine Intelligence and Advanced Computing, MOE, Guangzhou, China

{quanxy36,liuzhw33}@mail2.sysu.edu.cn, wszheng@ieee.org, {zhouyuren,wangruix5}@mail.sysu.edu.cn

A. Dataset details

Dataset details in benchmark I and II

ImageNet-100. We use the following categories that are randomly sampled from ImageNet-1K to create ImageNet-100. n01986214, n04200800, n03680355, n03208938,

100. 101/00.	211, 10120000	o, nocococco,	1105200750,
n02963159,	n03874293,	n02058221,	n04612504,
n02841315,	n02099712,	n02093754,	n03649909,
n02114712,	n03733281,	n02319095,	n01978455,
n04127249,	n07614500,	n03595614,	n04542943,
n02391049,	n04540053,	n03483316,	n03146219,
n02091134,	n02870880,	n04479046,	n03347037,
n02090379,	n10148035,	n07717556,	n04487081,
n04192698,	n02268853,	n02883205,	n02002556,
n04273569,	n02443114,	n03544143,	n03697007,
n04557648,	n02510455,	n03633091,	n02174001,
n02077923,	n03085013,	n03888605,	n02279972,
n04311174,	n01748264,	n02837789,	n07613480,
n02113712,	n02137549,	n02111129,	n01689811,
n02099601,	n02085620,	n03786901,	n04476259,
n12998815,	n04371774,	n02814533,	n02009229,
n02500267,	n04592741,	n02119789,	n02090622,
n02132136,	n02797295,	n01740131,	n02951358,
n04141975,	n02169497,	n01774750,	n02128757,
n02097298,	n02085782,	n03476684,	n03095699,
n04326547,	n02107142,	n02641379,	n04081281,
n06596364,	n03444034,	n07745940,	n03876231,
n09421951,	n02672831,	n03467068,	n01530575,
n03388043,	n03991062,	n02777292,	n03710193,

n09256479, n02443484, n01728572, n03903868.

We use the following OOD test data in ImageNet-1K and ImageNet-100 benchmark. The selected categories are disjoint with ImageNet-1K.

iNaturalist: iNaturalist contains 675,170 training and validation images from 5089 natural fine-grained categories, including 13 major categories such as plants, insects, birds, and mammals. We randomly sample 10000 images that are disjoint from ImageNet-1k for evaluation.

SUN: The Scene UNderstanding (SUN) contains 397 well-sampled categories to evaluate the performance of scene recognition algorithms. We randomly sample 10000 images that are disjoint from ImageNet-1k for evaluation.

Places: Places is a scene image dataset, which contains 10 million pictures and more than 400 different types of scene environments. We randomly sample 10000 images that are disjoint from ImageNet-1k for evaluation.

Textures: Describable Textures Dataset (DTD) is a texture dataset, including 5640 images, which can be divided into 47 categories according to human perception. We use the entire Textures dataset for evaluation.

Dataset details in CIFAR benchmark

For CIFAR benchmarks, we use the following OOD test dataset: SVHN: Street View House Number (SVHN) consists of the house numbers extracted from Google Street View images. We use the entire of its test set as OOD examples (26032 images).

Tiny ImageNet: Similar to ImageNet, Tiny ImageNet is an image classification dataset, which contains 200 categories, and each category contains 50 test images.

LSUN: LSUN is a scene understanding dataset, which mainly includes scene images of bedrooms, fixed houses, living rooms, classrooms, etc. We randomly sample 10000 images as out-of-distribution examples.

Textures: Describable Textures Dataset (DTD) is a texture dataset, including 5640 images, which can be divided into 47 categories according to human perception. We use the entire Textures dataset for evaluation.

iSUN: iSUN is a large-scale eye tracking dataset which contains 20608 natural scene images from the SUN database. We sample 8925 images with no conceptual overlap with CIFAR as out-of-distribution examples.

Places365: It contains large-scale photographs of scenes

^{*}Authors contributed equally

[†]Corresponding author

Out-of-distribution Detection Methods OOD datasets Metrics DICE+ReAct MSP Mahalanobis ODIN DICE ViM Energy BATS ReAct LogitNorm Ours 11.22 FPR95 33 79 29.66 41.38 43.80 36.67 20.65 26.37 24.19 38.22 17.40 SVHN AUROC 94.18 94.10 86.52 90.64 95.06 95.25 94.75 94.40 90.64 96.96 98.02 21.25 15.09 3.03 FPR95 32.13 86.48 14.21 14.79 54.27 12.85 14.72 3.52 Tiny-ImageNet 99.32 AUROC 87.68 97.68 97.22 97.21 99.17 95.23 92.44 97.91 96.25 97.56 FPR95 42.62 52.67 23.66 35.13 25.64 30.02 26.69 11.04 13.69 38.13 34.83 LSUN-R 94.16 AUROC 92.31 92.54 93.70 92.79 94.00 94.13 93.72 92.79 97 92 97 59 FPR95 20.47 92.99 7.03 6 67 49.00 5 32 10.67 6.72 6.67 0.48 0.34 LSUN-C CIFAR-10 AUROC 96.86 88.48 98.74 98.70 93.84 99.05 98.30 98.87 98.70 99.80 99.90 FPR95 52.26 37.49 32.47 29.18 11.39 13.46 ResNet34 45.17 26.03 40.95 28.17 40.95 iSUN 92.90 AUROC 91.71 92.41 93.18 90.92 93.84 93.46 93.46 89.92 97.86 97.56 FPR95 49.95 38.95 45.73 50.73 28.19 38.83 37.71 39.50 50.73 22.09 31.51 Textures AUROC 89.66 94.24 83.19 86.60 94.94 88.91 91.71 89 33 87.17 94.71 96.18 55.89 52.08 47.58 40.30 29.90 FPR95 53.69 49.65 41.49 41.84 49.67 27.56 Places365 AUROC 82.55 90.27 84.72 94.54 87.84 90.19 84.70 90.78 88.26 89.55 94.31 FPR95 39.69 60.09 30.37 33.51 40.62 24.71 28.62 25.90 33.74 15.03 13.06 Average AUROC 92.54 91.38 90.79 93.56 93.85 93.98 93.90 97.59 91.65 91.65 97.25 FPR95 45 43 83.53 51.98 48.99 12.85 35.61 39.91 36.07 47.16 24.31 19.26 SVHN AUROC 90.36 80.05 81.79 83.18 97.32 89.80 91.50 90.03 86.74 95.75 96.77 FPR95 99.38 8.70 10.28 0.62 1.58 1.39 24.61 8.77 0.84 27.71 17.47 Tiny-ImageNet 94.61 AUROC 96.31 43.41 98.13 99.74 98.45 96.90 98.18 99.80 99.47 99.56 FPR95 40.76 95.76 20.99 31.51 20.21 25.95 29.04 27.25 31.31 9.51 10.64 LSUN-R AUROC 92.78 94.61 91.51 94.25 94.79 94.43 92.04 98.07 97.97 61.18 96.04 FPR95 16 10 98 95 4 57 0.12 12.68 3 5 3 9 57 4 53 0.15 0.27 0.20 LSUN-C CIFAR10 AUROC 42.18 98.87 99.91 97.49 99.24 98.29 99.07 99.79 99.80 99.89 97.41 WideResNet28-10 FPR95 94.42 25.30 35.15 30.27 31.32 35.65 12.98 44.69 20.29 33.48 10.69 iSUN AUROC 92.00 63.46 93.60 90.49 95.94 93.30 93.79 93.58 89.21 97.84 97.79 FPR95 45.02 64.96 44.45 56.99 14.77 39.38 35.85 37.23 54.45 34.33 24.19 Textures AUROC 40.73 80.71 82.64 78.33 96.46 88.30 92.48 90.35 84.33 91.98 94.19 FPR95 45.54 81.56 46.67 54.24 42.07 36.81 35.20 37.12 56.25 26.86 25.60 Places365 69.52 AUROC 89.20 81.96 80.96 88.27 88.85 92.32 89.23 79.56 93.51 93.81 FPR95 37.45 88.37 28.98 32.56 21.51 25.75 28.66 26.26 32.82 15.36 13.32 Average AUROC 92.64 62.93 90.23 89.16 95.16 93.17 94.30 93.56 90.01 96.63 97.14

Table 1. Detailed results when using CIFAR-10 as ID data on seven common OOD benchmark datasets. ↑ indicates larger values are better and \downarrow indicates smaller values are better

with 365 scene categories. There are 100 images per category in the test set, we use the entire test set for evaluation.

B. Proof for $U_k(h(\mathbf{x}) - \boldsymbol{\mu})$ coincide with $\mathbf{M}(h(\mathbf{x}) - \boldsymbol{\mu})$

Denote by $\mathbf{z} = h(\mathbf{x})$ the feature representation for input x, and U = { u_1, \dots, u_K } the eigenvectors for principal directions, which is also can be viewed as orthogonal bases of principal coordinate system. View \mathbf{U}_k as a transform operator in the original feature space (fill the dimensions that were not involved in the transformation), we have

$$\mathbf{U}_k(h(\mathbf{x}) - \boldsymbol{\mu}) = \sum_{i=1}^k \langle \mathbf{z} - \boldsymbol{\mu}, \mathbf{u}_i \rangle \cdot \mathbf{u}_i + \sum_{j=k+1}^K 0 \cdot \mathbf{u}_j,$$
(1)

and after back projection, we have

$$\mathbf{M}(h(\mathbf{x}) - \boldsymbol{\mu}) = \mathbf{U}_k^{\mathsf{T}} \mathbf{U}_k(h(\mathbf{x}) - \boldsymbol{\mu})$$
(2)

$$=\sum_{i=1}^{k} \langle \mathbf{z} - \boldsymbol{\mu}, \mathbf{u}_i \rangle \cdot \langle \mathbf{u}_i, \mathbf{u}_i^{\mathsf{T}} \rangle \cdot \mathbf{u}_i^{\mathsf{T}} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{K} 0 \cdot \langle \mathbf{u}_j, \mathbf{u}_j^{\mathsf{T}} \rangle \cdot \mathbf{u}_j^{\mathsf{T}}$$
(3)

$$=\sum_{i=1}^{k} \langle \mathbf{z} - \boldsymbol{\mu}, \mathbf{u}_i \rangle \cdot \mathbf{u}_i^{\mathsf{T}} + \sum_{j=k+1}^{K} \mathbf{0} \cdot \mathbf{u}_j^{\mathsf{T}}$$
(4)

$$=\mathbf{U}_k(h(\mathbf{x}) - \boldsymbol{\mu}) \tag{5}$$

C. Detailed experimental results

We report the detailed performance for all seven test OOD datasets for models trained on CIFAR-10 and CIFAR-100 respectively in Table 1 and Table 2.

Table 2. Detailed results when using CIFAR-100 as ID data on seven common OOD benchmark datasets. \uparrow indicates larger values are better and \downarrow indicates smaller values are better

	OOD datasats	Metrics	Out-of-distribution Detection Methods										
	OOD uatasets Meth		MSP	ODIN	Mahalanobis	Energy	ViM	ReAct	BATS	DICE	DICE+ReAct	LogitNorm	Ours
	SVUN	FPR95	81.31	85.55	98.81	76.73	75.80	43.10	60.48	53.65	48.18	64.65	24.80
	3 1111	AUROC	77.61	76.83	54.62	81.52	82.31	92.22	89.50	89.97	91.19	88.69	95.08
	Tiny-ImageNet	FPR95	71.07	63.32	97.83	60.44	72.18	54.40	57.77	62.40	59.99	18.99	60.34
		AUROC	84.04	85.57	49.77	86.76	85.86	87.19	87.51	86.11	87.01	96.68	86.49
	LSUN-R	FPR95	74.39	38.18	97.38	58.02	37.70	41.60	38.64	85.83	84.17	93.39	26.96
		AUROC	82.08	92.96	53.35	88.40	93.40	91.58	92.96	76.80	78.80	69.28	95.08
	LSUN-C	FPR95	76.52	68.48	99.48	61.12	89.49	52.61	65.69	32.29	32.01	10.57	49.64
CIFAR100		AUROC	80.65	84.16	36.04	85.88	73.78	87.32	84.84	93.49	93.71	98.22	89.65
ResNet34	CUM	FPR95	75.99	41.92	94.64	61.82	38.51	41.95	40.80	86.01	82.23	94.39	28.13
	1501	AUROC	80.96	91.84	58.99	86.95	93.01	91.29	92.29	77.83	79.65	68.36	94.75
	Taxturas	FPR95	81.72	71.19	75.67	80.73	49.47	53.31	59.65	68.17	66.74	81.56	35.80
	Textures	AUROC	76.90	79.28	76.95	77.17	89.33	87.65	86.59	82.49	83.96	74.45	92.53
	Places365	FPR95	79.81	78.74	97.17	78.06	78.09	70.80	75.13	82.90	80.26	80.30	79.83
	r laces505	AUROC	77.30	75.54	51.33	76.72	78.17	79.73	78.96	76.31	78.04	77.59	76.73
	Average	FPR95	77.26	63.91	94.43	68.13	63.03	51.11	56.88	67.32	64.81	63.41	43.64
		AUROC	79.93	83.74	54.43	83.99	85.12	88.14	87.52	83.99	84.62	81.90	90.04
	SVHN	FPR95	81.83	88.35	54.47	81.09	49.55	76.69	79.61	72.91	84.17	27.40	59.00
CIFAR 100 WideResNet28-10	3 1111	AUROC	77.54	74.20	86.96	78.36	90.69	85.43	84.21	80.51	79.67	95.76	90.16
	Tiny-ImageNet	FPR95	53.78	39.11	99.55	35.53	81.43	45.81	47.30	9.96	22.51	14.66	46.75
	Tiny-magervet	AUROC	89.34	92.87	32.75	93.62	83.80	90.60	90.57	97.69	95.60	97.43	89.49
	LSUN-R	FPR95	80.09	57.99	45.73	78.67	49.04	67.95	67.03	85.69	97.85	82.51	50.05
		AUROC	77.38	86.38	90.28	80.34	90.31	84.54	85.15	79.72	53.43	79.00	89.40
	LSUN-C	FPR95	64.57	54.16	99.59	46.02	68.64	54.87	60.83	6.21	6.58	4.80	44.67
		AUROC	86.67	90.64	26.74	92.25	86.55	89.83	87.03	98.61	98.53	99.07	91.87
	iSUN	FPR95	81.62	58.69	45.46	80.96	44.45	67.93	68.89	88.65	98.51	84.67	46.16
		AUROC	76.98	86.06	90.26	79.49	90.82	84.75	84.86	78.08	54.78	77.78	90.22
	Textures	FPR95	80.66	75.09	33.58	78.09	33.00	66.26	70.01	77.29	72.80	69.43	37.73
		AUROC	77.19	78.09	91.82	78.16	93.14	85.85	84.58	76.52	74.21	80.46	91.82
	Places365	FPR95	78.41	76.63	93.51	79.50	82.91	75.64	77.29	82.64	92.81	75.12	78.19
	1 10003505	AUROC	78.40	78.34	59.38	77.97	76.32	81.36	80.47	76.15	62.69	81.06	79.60
	Average	FPR95	74.42	64.29	66.99	68.55	58.43	65.02	67.28	60.48	67.89	51.23	51.79
		AUROC	80.50	83.80	68.31	82.88	87.37	86.05	85.27	83.90	74.13	87.22	88.94