| Image | Generated captions | Ground truths |
|------------|--|---|
| | Base model: A wooden bench sitting on top of a wooden bench. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A box of books sitting on top of a wooden bench. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A book sitting on top of a wooden bench. LSTM decoder (H=1): A wooden bench sitting next to a wooden bench. AoA decoder (H=1): A wooden bench sitting on top of a wooden bench. Base decoder (H=8): A row of books sitting on a wooden bench. LSTM decoder (H=8): A row of books sitting on the side of a wooden bench. LSTM decoder (H=8): A row of benches sitting on the side of a wooden bench. LSTM decoder (H=8): A row of benches sitting on a wooden bench. LSTM decoder (H=8): A row of benches sitting on a wooden bench. | GT1: A book on a wooden bench on a street. GT2: A book rest on one of the benches. GT3: A california travel guide book on a park bench. GT4: A big entitled california is on the bench. GT5: A book sitting on top of a wooden desk. |
| PARANDALIS | Base model: A mountain with a mountain in the background. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A view of a mountain with a mountain in the background. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A black and white photo of a mountain. LSTM decoder (H=1): A mountain in the background with a mountain. Base decoder (H=8): A view of a mountain with a mountain. LSTM decoder (H=8): A view of a mountain in the background. AoA decoder (H=8): A view of a mountain in the background. AoA decoder (H=8): A view of a mountain with a mountain in the background. Full (AoANet): A black and white photo of a mountain covered with snow. | GT1: A black and white picture of hills or mountains. GT2: A black and white photo of mountains and the sky. GT3: A black and white photograph of mountains with snow. GT4: A black and white picture of the top view of a snow capped mountain somewhere. GT5: A large mountain range partially covered with snow. |
| | Base model: A brown bear eating a piece of food. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A brown bear eating a piece of food. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A monkey eating a doughnut in a rock. LSTM decoder (H=1): A brown bear sitting on top of a rock eating a piece of food. AoA decoder (H=1): A brown bear sitting on top of a rock eating a snack. Base decoder (H=8): A brown bear eating a banana in its mouth. LSTM decoder (H=8): A brown bear eating a piece of food. AoA decoder (H=8): A brown bear eating a piece of food. AoA decoder (H=8): A brown bear eating a piece of food. Full (AoANet): A monkey sitting on rocks eating a piece of food. | GT1: Small monkey eating fruit sitting on a rock. GT2: A small monkey sitting and eating in its habitat. GT3: A little monkey sitting next to a rock eating a piece of fruit. GT4: A monkey is eating while sitting on a rock. GT5: A monkey sits downs while eating some food. |
| | Base model: A vase with purple flowers sitting on a table. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A vase with flowers sitting on top of a table. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A white vase with purple flowers sitting on a table. LSTM decoder (H=1): A vase with flowers sitting on top of a table. AoA decoder (H=1): A vase with flowers sitting on a table. Base decoder (H=8): A white vase with purple flowers sitting on a table. LSTM decoder (H=8): A white vase with purple flowers sitting on a table. LSTM decoder (H=8): A white vase with flowers sitting on a table. LSTM decoder (H=8): A vase with flowers sitting on a table. LSTM decoder (H=8): A vase filled with purple flowers on a table. Full (AoANet): A white vase filled with purple flowers on a table. | GT1: A vase of light and dark purple flowers in a white vase. GT2: A close up of a vase with many flowers. GT3: A bouquet of fresh flowers in a cream colored vase. GT4: A small white vase of purple flowers on a table. GT5: A white vase filled with purple flowers on top of a table. |
| | Base model: A cat laying on top of a bed. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A black and white cat laying on a bed. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A cat laying on top of a blanket. LSTM decoder (H=1): A cat laying on top of a bed. AoA decoder (H=1): A cat laying on top of a blanket. Base decoder (H=8): A cat laying on top of a bed. LSTM decoder (H=8): A cat laying on top of a bed. AoA decoder (H=8): A cat laying on top of a bed. Full (AoANet): A cat laying on a bed with a blanket. | GT1: A cat under a blanket looking at something.GT2: A small cat peeking its head from under a blanket.GT3: A cute kitten peeking out from under a quilt.GT4: A gray tiger cat sleeping on a bed under a blanket.GT5: A cat is peeping out from under a blanket. |
| | Base model: A traffic light on the side of a street. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A traffic light on the side of a street. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A group of traffic lights on a city street. LSTM decoder (H=1): A traffic light on a city street with a building. AoA decoder (H=1): A traffic light on a city street with buildings. Base decoder (H=8): A traffic light on the side of a city street. LSTM decoder (H=8): A traffic light on the side of a street. LSTM decoder (H=8): A traffic light on the side of a street. AoA decoder (H=8): A traffic light on a city street with a city. Full (AoANet): A street with traffic lights and buildings in the background. | GT1: A couple of traffic lights hanging over a city street. GT2: Traffic lights shine over an empty intersection at twilight. GT3: A street with traffic lights, wall and buildings. GT4: The electronic traffic signals are lit up during dawn. GT5: Empty city intersection in the early morning hours. |
| | Base model: A brown horse standing in the water next to a lake. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): Two horses are standing in the water. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): Two horses are standing in the water. LSTM decoder (H=1): A horse standing in the water in a field. AoA decoder (H=1): A horse standing in the water near a river. Base decoder (H=8): A horse standing in the water. LSTM decoder (H=8): A horse standing in the water in a field. AoA decoder (H=8): A horse standing in the water in a field. AoA decoder (H=8): A horse standing in the water in a field. AoA decoder (H=8): A horse standing in the water next to a river. Full (AoANet): Two horses walking in the water in a field. | GT1: A couple of horses standing in a river next to an island. GT2: Two horses standing in a stream next to a wooded area. GT3: Two horses are walking through a river together. GT4: Horses standing in shallow water in a wooded area. GT5: Two horses that are standing in some water. |

Figure 1: Captions generated by the ablated models and AoANet, as well as the corresponding ground truths.

| Image | Generated captions | Ground truths |
|-------|--|--|
| | Base model: A man standing in front of a car with a UNK. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A man wearing a hat standing next to a beach with a frisbee. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A man standing in a parking lot with a frisbee. LSTM decoder (H=1): A man is standing next to a car on a water. AoA decoder (H=1): A man is standing on a car with a frisbee. Base decoder (H=3): A man standing in a parking lot with a frisbee. LSTM decoder (H=8): A man sitting on a parking lot with a frisbee. LSTM decoder (H=8): A man standing in a parking lot with a frisbee. LSTM decoder (H=8): A man standing in a parking lot with a frisbee. Full (AoANet): A man wearing a hat holding a frisbee in a parking lot. | GT1: A man in holds a frisbee in the parking lot by the river.GT2: The man found the frisbee by the parked cars.GT3: A man holding a frisbee in a parking lot near water.GT4: A man holding a white object in his hand.GT5: A man wearing a hat and holding an object in his hand. |
| | Base model: A pool with a pool with people and umbrellas. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A group of people standing in a park with umbrellas. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A group of people standing in a pool with umbrellas. LSTM decoder (H=1): A pool with a pool with a pool with a pool. AoA decoder (H=3): A pool with a pool with a pool with people. Base decoder (H=8): A pool with a pool with a bunch of chairs and a table. AoA decoder (H=8): A swimming pool with a bunch of chairs and a table. AoA decoder (H=8): A swimming pool with tables and chairs with umbrellas. Full (AoANet): A swimming pool with umbrellas and people standing. | GT1: The clear pool stood empty as people stood around nearby. GT2: Some people walking around a swimming pool and trees. GT3: Large swimming pool with tents near the trees. GT4: A large in ground swimming pool near tents. GT5: A pool with several visitors sitting beside it. |
| | Base model: A group of people walking down a street with skateboards. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A man and a child riding on a skateboard. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A man and a little girl on a skateboard. LSTM decoder (H=1): A group of people riding skateboards down a street. AoA decoder (H=1): A group of people riding skateboards down a street. Base decoder (H=8): A group of people riding skateboards down a street. LSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman riding a skateboard down a street. LSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman riding a skateboard down a street. AoA decoder (H=8): A man and a child on a skateboard. Full (AoANet): A man and a child sitting on a skateboard. | GT1: A girl hitching a ride with her dad on a skateboard. GT2: A man riding a skateboard has a child between his legs. GT3: A girl sits between a mans legs on a skateboard. GT4: A man riding a skateboard next to a woman. GT5: The skateboarder has a passenger on his skateboard. |
| | Base model: A man and a woman standing in a kitchen preparing food. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A group of people standing in a kitchen. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A group of people standing in a kitchen preparing food. LSTM decoder (H=1): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. AoA decoder (H=1): A group of people standing in a kitchen. Base decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. LSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. LSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. LSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. JSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. JSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. JSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. JSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. JSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. JSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. JSTM decoder (H=8): A man and a woman standing in a kitchen. | GT1: A picture of an older man cutting a turkey on the counter. GT2: A group of people that are standing in the kitchen. GT3: A group of people standing over some food. GT4: Three people agree in the kitchen near a cluttered bar. GT5: A number of people in a kitchen preparing food. |
| | Base model: A picture of a garden with a plant in a window. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A bunch of apples in a window with a window. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A garden with a bunch of apples and a window. LSTM decoder (H=1): A picture of a bunch of plants in a house. AoA decoder (H=1): A collage of pictures of a house with a tree. Base decoder (H=8): A group of plants in a window with a table. LSTM decoder (H=8): A picture of a tree with a bunch of apples. AoA decoder (H=8): A collage of pictures of a garden with a tree. Full (AoANet): A collage of pictures of a house with a flower. | GT1: Multiple images are seen showing forest scenes and a small cottage. GT2: A collection of different plants and fields, with a tomato plant being the most prominent. GT3: Various types of pictures that are of different plants. GT4: Colorful collection of pictures of a wooded area. GT5: A collage of several photos show outdoor scenes. |
| | Base model: A man hitting a tennis ball with a tennis racket. Encoder (w/ refining, w/o AoA): A group of people playing tennis on a tennis court. Encoder (w/ refining, w/ AoA): A group of people playing tennis on a tennis court. LSTM decoder (H=1): A group of people playing tennis on a tennis court. AoA decoder (H=1): A couple of women standing on a tennis court with tennis balls. Base decoder (H=8): A couple of people holding tennis rackets at a tennis ball. LSTM decoder (H=8): A woman hitting a tennis ball with a tennis racket. AoA decoder (H=8): Two women playing tennis on a tennis court. | GT1: Two young sexy women holding tennis racquets and tennis balls. GT2: A pair of young women hold tennis balls and rackets. GT3: Two women on a tennis court with tennis rackets and balls. GT4: Two female tennis players standing with their rackets. GT5: Two women with tennis rackets and balls are standing. |

Figure 2: More examples.